Science and Security Clash on Bird-Flu Papers

By Josh Fischman

It was the week before Christmas, and D.A. Henderson was alarmed about germs. He isn’t easily rattled. Dr. Henderson led the successful worldwide effort to eradicate smallpox in the 1970s, and he directed the U.S. Office of Public Health Emergency Preparedness after the deadly anthrax letter attacks and the destruction of the World Trade Center in 2001. But recently not just one but two laboratories had engineered the virus known as bird flu to make it easily transmissible—through the air, among mammals—and that was a scary development.

“Compared to plague or to anthrax, this one has a potential for disaster that dwarfs all others,” says Dr. Henderson, now a distinguished scholar at the Center for Biosecurity of the University of Pittsburgh Medical Center. “Given our flu-vaccine capacity, which is limited, this could be a catastrophe if it gets out.” The experiments shouldn’t have been done, in his view, and—partly because they could give terrorists a blueprint for making a more deadly form of H5N1 avian-influenza virus—they certainly shouldn’t be published.

Now they won’t be, at least not completely. In an unprecedented move that same week, a federal advisory panel on biosecurity echoed Dr. Henderson’s concerns and recommended that papers describing the findings be partly censored, stripped of crucial details about the methods used to make the viruses. The authors and the journals set to publish the work reluctantly agreed. But far from quelling the controversy, the decision has ignited a fierce debate: Can publishing such work save millions of lives by speeding development of drugs and vaccines, or will withholding it save even more lives from a killer? “The science wasn’t all crucial, and we did not want to provide a road map for something bad,” explains the acting chair of the biosecurity panel, Paul Keim, a professor of biology at Northern Arizona University. “It’s a stupid rule,” counters Maria S. Salvato, a professor at the Institute of Human Virology at the University of Maryland School of Medicine, arguing that the method was already out. “This is the... Continued on Page A6

Haitian Universities Struggle to Rebound

2 years after earthquake, campuses remain hamstrung by lack of equipment and people

By Andrew Downie

Two years ago, Haiti’s government put far more resources toward elementary and secondary education than toward its universities.

Physics students attend class in a tent at the State U. of Haiti, where much of the campus was rendered unusable by the earthquake two years ago. Haiti’s government puts far more resources toward elementary and secondary education than toward its universities.

Penn State Scandal Encompasses Professors, Too

Faculty members demand greater role in university affairs

By Robin Wilson

On game days you won’t find Robert C. Marshall at the football stadium with the fans flaunting Pennsylvania State University blue and white. Mr. Marshall, chairman of the university’s economics department, doesn’t like crowds and prefers to spend his Saturdays playing golf or revising a research paper.

So it was unusual for Mr. Marshall, after the Penn State child-abuse scandal broke last fall, to go out and buy both a Nittany Lion ring and a lapel pin. He also fished around in a closet at home and found his sole piece of Penn State paraphernalia: a blue bull cap.

Now he wears the stuff when he’s off the campus. It’s part of his attempt to tell people what he thinks the university is really about: a place defined more by top-notch academics than by headline-grabbing athletics. “If people want to ask, ‘Why are you wearing that?’ I will say: ‘We are doing fine academic work at Penn State,’” says Mr. Marshall, who points out that his department produces Ph.D. graduates who go on to be professors at institutions like Harvard, Princeton, and New York University.

While most of the national focus following charges of child sex abuse at Penn State has centered on its coaches and administrators, the scandal has reached deep into the professoriate as well. Responding to constant questions has taken an emotional toll on the university’s faculty members, who have been asked by neighbors, friends, and fellow academics to explain how something so heinous could happen there.